Restrictive Relative Clause に関する一考察

— Who, Whom, That, Which, Zero ——

三好暢茂

（１）

関係代名詞の制限的用法について、personal な先行詞には that よりも who が好まれる傾向にあり non-personal な先行詞には which よりも that が好まれる傾向にあるとされている。

C. C. Fries の約 3,000 通の手紙を資料として行った調査によると Standard English では that の neuters を示す数は 91 例で persons を示す数は 2 例のみであり, “That as a relative pronoun for persons (introducing “restrictive” clauses) is used freely in Vulgar English but rarely in Standard English.”

と指摘している。

先行詞が non-personal な場合の関係代名詞 that と which の数の比は 91 : 121 で、which の中には若干ではあるが非制限的用法も含まれていると考えられるが、この数字は writing の場合 which が that よりも好まれている傾向を示している。(2)

これに対して R. W. Zandvoolt は “...that is more usual than which with reference to things.”(3) と述べている。又 spoken English では which よりも that が好まれるとされている。(4)

接触節 (Contact-clause)(5) については、C. C. Fries によると Standard English では先行詞が neuters の場合の数は 26 例、先行詞が persons の数は 1 例である。又 Vulgar English では 52 : 13 でともに先行詞が non-personal な時に頻出することを示している。(6)

この小論は現代アメリカ英語の Restrictive Relative Clause における that, who, whom, which, zero, 関係代名詞について統計的に調査したものである。但し副詞的に用いられている that と接触節は統計の対象外とした。

（２）

調査資料として現代アメリカ英語の一典型である Reader's Digest 誌を用いた。表中の 1 ～ 10 の数字は本稿のうち示されている雑誌の発行年月日を示す。

Table (1) は先行詞が personal な場合の主語に立つ関係代名詞 who と that の統計である。Table (3) は先行詞が personal な場合の目的語に立つ zero, whom, that の統計である。

A. 主語に立つ場合

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>関係詞</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>T</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>who</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>897</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>that</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
That は指示詞起原であるだけに、不確定調起原の who, which よりも限定性が強いといえる。そのため、節の限定的性格の特に強い次の場合には、that を用いるのが普通である。文典によっては、下記の場合には that がもっぱら用いられ、who, which は用いられないとしてもいるものもあるくらいである。この点に関しての who と that の本調査での統計は次の Table (2) の結果となった。

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>関係詞</th>
<th>(a)</th>
<th>(b)</th>
<th>(c)</th>
<th>(d)</th>
<th>(e)</th>
<th>T</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>who</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>that</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(表中の (a) ～ (e) はそれぞれ下記の項目を表す。)

(a) It is (was) の後
O. Jespersen によると (a) と下記の (c) の場合は “...that is freely applied to persons.” とあるが who が圧倒的に優勢であった。

The state will prove that it was this man who conceived the idea of having the blacks of this nation gather in large members to observe the anniversary of what he called Soweto ’76.
—Sept., ’80, p. 228.

It was the French paratroopers who made headlines in the world press for their victorious operations, but it was the ICRC that quietly kept 80,000 civilians from starving.
—Aug., ’81, p. 120.

It was a brave man who ate the first chili pepper, but it was an even braver one who ate the second.
—Jun., ’81, p. 99.

(b) 不定代名詞、殊に any-, every-, no の複合語、all の後
O. Jespersen によると “After anybody everybody, etc., that and who are perhaps equally frequent” と指摘しているが、本調査では that の用例は 2 例で who の用例は 99 例であった。その内訳は any- は 29 例、every- は 12 例、some- は 22 例、no- は 4 例、all は 8 例。他者不定代名詞 24 例であった。

There’s hardly anybody in this bunch that doesn’t have mental problems of some sort.
—Dec., ’80, p. 63.

Although admission is open to anyone who can pay the $70-per-month tuition, students measure two years ahead of their public school counterparts in both reading and math achievement.
—Jun., ’80, p. 28.

Webster has been effective in meeting this challenge at least in part because everyone who meets him realizes immediately that this is an honor-bound “straight arrow.”
—Sept., ’80, p. 146.

John Gibbons, director of Congress’s Office of Technology Assessment, and head of the NAS study on energy conservation, sums up the opinion of almost every one who has examined its potential:
—Jun., ’80, p. 81.

...and I know of nobody who could get me into one quicker.
—Aug., ’81, p. 131.
But it didn’t take an expert to see no one was left who could challenge Heiden.  

And here again is a frightening yet heartening testament to all who cherish the conviction that freedom and the integrity of the individual will triumph.  
—Jan., ’82, p. 118.

Swearing the 36 Triad oaths means vowing to murder all who stand in the society’s way.  
—Dec., ’81, p. 127.

(c) 先行詞に最上級の形容詞, the very, the last, the first, only, etc. を伴っている場合

"Why don't you write about Benny Leonard?" He was the best Jewish fighter who ever lived.  

I'd like to mention that I was the only newspaper publisher who personally signed articles condemning terrorism and accusing terrorist leaders by name.  
—Jan., ’82, p. 140.

The same Democratic Congressmen who defeated comprehensive tax reduction approved federal welfare expansion based on the discredited idea of a guaranteed annual income.  
—Sept., ’80, p. 75.

I got a lock of his hair and towel saturated with the blood of the best man that was President and a friend of the south.  
—Oct., ’80, p. 276.

I and Carey was about the only ones in the club that spoke to each other, and all we did was remind ourself o' what a boner we'd pulled.  
—Jun., ’80, p. 93.

(d) 疑問詞 who を先行詞とする場合, (e) 述語として用いられる場合は共に該当例が見られなかった。(e) については Quirk らが "When the verb in the relative clause is Be, the complement pronoun cannot be wh-, whether antecedent is personal or non-personal: "(to) と指摘しているように that か zero となる。zero の用例は 8 例見られた。先行詞が personal な例は 2 例であった。

Although now 24, Kenny was still remembered for the fine and fearless highschool football player he had been.  
—Aug., ’81, p. 92.

People who strive for such excellence—whether they are driving a truck, or running a country store, or bringing up a family—make the world better just by being the kind of people they are.  
—Sept., ’80, p. 148.

(f) (a) ～(e) 以外の that の用例

There is not a man in the country that can’t make a living for himself and family.  
—Aug., ’80, p. 181.

I know men that would make my wife a better husband than I am; but, darn it, I’m not going to give her to 'em.  
—Aug., ’80, p. 182.
Often the premature baby is less ready to meet his parents than a full
time baby that is delivered vaginally.

—Dec., ’81, p. 96.

(b) 接触節—補うとすれば主語となる場合
there is (are) の次、または there is を節中に含む用例は 0 で、目的語節に連鎖する型が 7 例あったが、先行詞が personal な数は 2 例であった。

Employees are authorized to pay the cab fare for any person they think is
inebriated and who is about to drive.

—Jun., ’80, p. 8.

Instead, I wrote letters asking for the tiniest glimmer of news of Pran,
to every person and organization I thought might be able to help.

—Dec., ’81, p. 25.

Quirk らが "...Who is favored irrespective of the style and occasion:"
と指摘しているように、本調査の結果も who と that の相対頻度は 897 (97.6%) : 22 (2.4%) で per-
sonal な先行詞には殆ど that が使われず、従来 that が好まれるとされている (a), (b), (e)
の項目においても who が圧倒的に優勢である。将来、that は使われなくなる可能性があること
to do していると考えられる。

又述語として用いられる場合は用倒数が少なく、今後の調査課題としておくがやや zero が
好まれる傾向にあると推定される。

B. 目的語として立つ場合

先行詞が personal で目的語として立つ場合を 6 個の型に分類して調査したもののが Table (3)
である。表中では次の略語を用いた。

(a) 接触節が動詞の目的語 —cvo
(b) 接触節が前置詞の目的語—cpo
(c) whom が動詞の目的語 —wvo
(d) whom が前置詞の目的語—wpo
(e) that が動詞の目的語 —tvo
(f) that が前置詞の目的語 —tpo

Table (3)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>関係語</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>T</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>contact-clause</td>
<td>cvo</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>cpo</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>whom</td>
<td>wvo</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>wpo</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>that</td>
<td>tvo</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>tpo</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(a)

Everyone I did call, however, whooped in memory of old times, and I was

— 20 —
back sitting at their tables as fast as I could go from one to another.  
—Oct., ’80, p. 208.

The fourth alternative shocked me, but since it was proposed by one of  
the finest men I’ve met here, I must take it seriously.  —Sept., ’80, p. 232.

Dr. Fitzhugh notified the plastic surgeons he knew, and wrote letters of  
recommendation to the hospitals.  —Jun., ’80, p. 246.

Cremer insisted later that he did not know the man he met was Wolf, but  
West German authorities nevertheless accused him of consorting with a foreign  

(b)

The child the teachers talked about is not the same child who comes home  
to me (or, more precisely, to my refrigerator) each night.  
—Jun., ’81, p. 80.

Now every white- and blue-collar worker I spoke to—without a single  
exception—expressed discontent or anger.  —Oct., ’80, p. 209.

But I’m still convinced that these soldiers are as good—and will fight as  
well—as any I’ve served with in my 37 years in the U.S. Army.  
—Dec., ’80, p. 104.

“And get a look at some of the fellows you’ll have to compete with to be  
the richest man underground.”  —Jun., ’81, p. 81.

(c)

In the city’s hip Gestown district he had met a French cocaine dealer  
whom he knew only as “Jacques.”  —May, ’80, p. 243.

The 17-year-old boy whom Ritter steered away from suicide is now a  
restaurant cook, enthusiastic about his job and life.  —Oct., ’80, p. 118.

Varley handed Barbara a photo of a woman she had never met but whom  
she felt she already knew.  —Dec., ’80, p. 122.

The Montoneros assassinated those engaged in their suppression; those  
whom they regarded as doing nothing to oppose those who suppressed them:  
—Jan., ’82, p. 121.

(d)

The general on whom they depended most to lead them, Koos de la Rey,  
was killed by a ricocheting bullet.  —Aug., ’80, p. 135.

An “acceptable level of unemployment” simply means that the government  
economist to whom it is acceptable still has a job.  —Oct., ’80, p. 67.

She faced the death of her husband of six years—a man with whom she  
shared the beauty of a passionate love I have rarely seen equaled—...  
—Jan., ’82, p. 114.
In 1950 the late Dr. Lawrence L. Craven wrote to a small western medical journal about 400 overweight, sedentary male patients to whom he had given one or two aspirin tablets a day.

—Dec., '80, p. 131.

(e), (f) の該当例は見い出されなかった。目的語として立つ場合は接触節が 73.5%，whom が 26.5%で接触節が好まれる傾向にある。これは Quirk らが “...and much stronger pre-
fer for that or zero, perhaps to avoid the choice between who and whom.”(10) と指摘し
that が whom より好まれると述べているが本稿の調査結果には that の例が見い出されず
現代アメリカ英語では that が避けられ whom が使われる傾向にあると推定される。

(Ⅲ)

non-personal な先行詞に立つ that, which, zero, における主語と目的語に分けて相対頻度
を示したものがそれぞれ Table (4), (5) である。

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table (4)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>that</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>which</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table (5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(f)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(a) that が動詞の目的語
(b) that が前置詞の目的語
(e) which が動詞の目的語
(d) which が前置詞の目的語
(e) 接触節が動詞の目的語
(f) 接触節が前置詞の目的語

(1) Table (4) の中で It is (was)～that 型の強勢構文は 36 例で、It is (was)～which 型
は 1 例あった。補うとすれば主語となる接触節が 5 例あったが、すべて次の例の如く連鎖関
係詞節の型であった。

Meisner said that in 1974 Scientology had mounted an all-out attack on
U.S. government agencies the church thought were interfering with its opera-

— 22 —
Restrictive Relative Clause に関する考察（三好栄茂）

Since 1970, however, tens of Americans have been taking a substance they believe can remedy it-vitamin C (ascorbic acid).

And that's how it was as Beatrice and Lucy settled in with us, convivial companions on a journey they both seemed to know was nearing its destination.

As a teenager, he made his first "big money", taking a chance on a gold ring with a stone the seller insisted was synthetic.

(2) Table (5) が示すように、「前置詞～which」型 196 (79.4%)、「that～前置詞」型は 5 例 (2.0%)、「接触節～前置詞」型は 46 (18.6%) である。which が多く使われるのはこの「前置詞～which」型に集中する傾向が見られ、「which～前置詞」型の該当例はなかった。この結果から "preposition at end" の型が好まれない傾向にあることが推察される。

And there they wait for the seals of the narwhals on which the village still relies for much of its food and clothing.

The light for which the world is waiting is a new light, the glory that shall rise out of patient, triumphant suffering.

Having divined the depth of talent with which each of her students was endowed, she simply proposed to develop it to the full.

The leader then asked if there was any bad news that we should know about.

It was the last thing Vince wanted to happen, and for a moment he thought of abandoning all that he had been fighting for.

She mentioned female disorders that she needed to attend to before she left Japan.

The only thing I could come up with was a pair of my son's football pants, a jersey and a helmet.

That means knowing and understanding the emotions that churn inside us, the desires and needs that motivate us, the fears we must cope with.

And nothing beats liquid dishwashing detergent for getting rid of white flies, one of the worst pests gardeners have to contend with.

又 Table (5) が示す加く動詞，前置詞の目的語に立つ that，which，zero の相対頻度は 133 (14.3%)：233 (25.1%)：563 (60.6%) で，圧倒的に接触節が好まれる傾向にある。これに関して Quirk らが "...，when the subject is a personal pronoun，zero is preferred to either which or that，especially if the relative clause itself is fairly short and simple."（139）

— May，'80，p. 90.

— Aug.，'80，p. 94.

— Jun.，'80，p. 168.

— Jan.，'82，p. 64.

— Sept.，'80，p. 176.


— Jun.，'80，p. 152.

— Sept.，'80，p. 94.


— Aug.，'80，p. 173.

— Jun.，'81，p. 43.
と指摘している通りの結果を得た。又、人称代名詞を主語とする場合は、節の長短が zero, which, that の選択に関連があると述べている。接触節の最も頑度の高い (e) の 517 例から人称代名詞を主語とする 403 例, (e) の 37 例から 22 例, (a) の 128 例から 39 例をそれぞれ選んで、節の長さを示したもののが次の Table (6) である。Table (7) は (e) の 403 例を年号別に示したものである。

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>関係詞</th>
<th>語数</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8 以上</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>zero</td>
<td></td>
<td>112</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>which</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>that</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>年号</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>T</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2 語</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 語</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>92</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 語</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 語</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>46</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 語</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 語</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 語以上</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

この調査結果から、節の長さが 3 語以内の zero と which と that の相対頻度は 94.9%: 0.05%: 4.7% で接触節が圧倒的に好まれる傾向にある。接触節 403 例の中でも、3 語以内は 204 例で 50.6% の高い頻度を占め、結果となった。8 語以上の比較的長い接触節は 44 例で、2% であった。接触節 8 語以上の例は次の如くである。

I cut along the incision he had marked out in blue surgical ink on the patient's belly.
—Jun., '80, p. 223.

Dramatic changes have occurred recently in the relationships of the sexes and in the roles men and women are expected to play within the family and at work.
—Aug., '80, p. 176.

As the Japanese now admit, the first cars they exported to the United States a little more than 20 years ago were ponkotsu.
—Dec., '81, p. 39.

Middle Age is when you realize that you'll never live long enough to try all the recipes you spent 30 years clipping out of newspapers and magazines.
—Jan., '82, p. 39.

[3] Hornby が "Which is occasionally used as the subject for things, but that is much commoner."(10) 述べているように、主語に立つ that と which の相対頻度は 989（90%）: 110（10%）で圧倒的に that が好まれる傾向にある。

— 24 —
又，Table (6), (7) が示すことにより that と which の相対頻度は 1,119 (76.5%) : 343 (23.5%）で，前述の C.C. Fries の結果とは異なり現代アメリカ英語では that が圧倒的に好まれる傾向があると考えられる。従来までは that が避けられ which が好まれるとされている場合（15）にも that が使用されていると推察される。その調査結果は次のようになる。（a）

(a) that（those）又は that（those）を伴う名詞を先行詞とする場合

関係代名詞 that の用例は 17 例で that を先行詞に伴う場合は 2 例，those を先行詞としている場合は 4 例，those を先行詞に伴う場合は 7 例であった。

which は 14 例で that を先行詞に伴う場合は 5 例，that を先行詞とする場合は 7 例，those を先行詞に伴う場合が 2 例であった。この結果から those を先行詞に伴う場合は自由に that が使われると考えられる。

I can see your brow knittig in that way that I love. That crinkle between your eyebrows that signals your doubt and your skepticism.

—Jun., ’81, p. 106.

Eggs that sink are fresh. Those that float are stale. —Jun., ’81, p. 47.

Those (=beetles) that bang our window screens grow from fat white grubs.

—May, ’80, p. 70.

Yet those qualities that once made the humble burro so useful have also made him the storm center of controversy.

—Jan., ’82, p. 12.

And two of my gifts are gone. I have spent for man that which was meant for God.

—Dec., ’80, p. 260.

Out of weariness, perhaps, or resignation, or that sensation which so often assails the tortured—a presentiment of imminent death—I do not answer.

—Jan., ’82, p. 132.

Trying hard to avoid those embarrassing situations which seem to plague newlyweds, the honeymoon couple carefully removed every grain of rice from their hair, ......

—Jan., ’82, p. 36.

(b) 関係詞がかけ離れた動詞，前縁詞の目的語として立つ場合

かけ離れた基準を 6 語以上すると that は 6 例，which は 3 例であった。

With all the time she had, he figured, she might unearth something that police didn’t have the man-hours to dig up.

—Dec., ’80, p. 121.

A phenomenon that you with your Dutch backround might anticipate, but which I certainly didn’t, is the Afrikaner’s unshakable belief......

—Sept., ’80, p. 231.

I began to dream of a world that boys from America’s hinterland would, in World War II, see sooner than we thought.

—Aug., ’80, p. 84.

Almost every one of Mason’s adventures is based on a legal principle or
was suggested by a case which Erle Stanley Gardner, a California trial lawyer himself, used in court. —May., '80, p. 110.

He had said certain things which college professors and students around the world say every day. —Sept., '80, p. 231.

There are three great questions which in life we have over and over again to answer: —Dec., '80, p. 145.

(c) 先行詞との間にかなりの隔たりがある場合
6 語以上の基準にして選ぶと that は 11 例、which は二重制限の 2 例のみであった。

Our adult Sunday school often starts with the leader asking if anything good happened to anyone during the week that he would like to mention. —Jun., '80, p. 152.

Do you think that the Israelis will ever agree to a form of autonomy for the Palestinians Gaza and on the West Bank that will satisfy the Palestinians and other Arabs? —Aug., '80, p. 56.

......“a policy which requires the expropriation of Arab land unrelated to Israel’s security needs and which presumes to occupy permanently a region populated by 750,000 Palestinian Arabs, we find morally unacceptable.... —May, '80, p. 180.

......if their husbands died, they too could be exiled to some distant spot for blacks which they had never seen and with which they had no affiliation whatever except by dictate of the new laws. —Aug., '80, p. 212.

(d) 関係詞の直後に休止（pause）がある場合
that は 5 例、which は 4 例であった。that の使用頻度も高くなっていると考えられる。

Remarkable as this story may seem, dream researchers note that a high percentage of both adults and children have repetitive dreams that, while not always identical, often show surprising similarities in both content and theme. —Oct., '80, p. 121.

It is a time when no one can see the future because its directions are so diverse, but also a time when everyone can find a vision that, for him, illuminates the Christian faith. —Oct., '80, p. 50.

Primarily for these small farmers, RRIM* scientists have developed a latex stimulant that, when painted on the bark, delays coagulation and produces a dramatic increase in the flow of latex. * The Rubber Research Institute of Malaysia. —Jan., '82, p. 28.

......and we were getting many other necessary programs under way, including the B-1 bomber, the Trident-submarine program, cruise-missile programs for both the Navy and Air Force, and a Navy shipbuilding program which, had it been completed, would have had us in good shape by now. —Sept., '80, p. 104.

— 26 —
First Hayakawa, then Van Deerlin introduced bills *which*, if either passed both Houses, would allow Jimmy to take out papers and become a citizen of the United States after five years.

—Oct., '80, p. 156.

The majority are unaware of the existence of any other paper *which*, on a daily basis, bids the government respect the laws and at least publish a list of those who've been arrested.

—Jan., '82, p. 124.

(IV)

以上の今回の統計調査の結果から、現代アメリカ英語の一般的傾向は personal な先行詞には *that* よりも *who, whom* が好まれる傾向にある。特に主語に立つ場合は、*who* が圧倒的使用頻度が高く從来学校文法が *that* を使うことを原則としている場合にも、*that* が使われることはむしろ稀である。目的語の場合用例数が満足すべき数とはいええないが、*that* よりも *whom* が好まれる傾向にあると考えられる。

Non-personal な先行詞については、主語に立つ場合 *that* が圧倒的に使用頻度が高く、*which* が好まれるとされている場合にも *that* が使われる傾向にある。又、*which* の機能は *that* の持たない機能である「前置詞 + which」型に集中化の傾向がみられる。動詞、前置詞の目的語に立つ場合は *zero* が圧倒的に使用頻度が高く *that, which* の順序であった。*zero* となる場合、節の主語が人称名詞で節の長さが短い場合に頻出する。以上がこの調査分析の結果である。

—— 註 ——

(1) Fries, C. C., American English Grammar (Appleton, 1940) p. 228.
(2) Ibid., pp. 207-228.
(4) 小西友六，『現代英語の文法と背景』（研究社，1969），p. 111.
(5) O. Jespersen が“He falls in love with all the girls he sees.” “This is the boy we spoke of.” などの文に与えた用語。
   Otto Jespersen, Essentials of English Grammar (George Allen & Unwin, 1933), §34.3.
(6) Fries, op. cit., p. 231.
(7) 大塚高信編，『新英文学辞典』（三省堂，1970），p. 917.
(8) Jespersen, op. cit., §34.4.
(9) Loc. cit.
(11) Loc. cit.
(12) Loc. cit.
(13) Ibid., p. 871.
(15) 荒木一雄，『関係詞』『英文法シリーズ』第一集，（研究社，1979），pp. 473-475.

—— 調査資料 ——

Reader's Digest 誌10冊。
この内 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 8 は本国版である。